

# Implementation and Evaluation of Teachers' Performance Supervision at Madrasah Aliyah (Islamic Senior High School): A Case Study of MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin

# Tambrin, M<sup>1\*</sup>, Wasliman, I<sup>2</sup>, Hanafiah<sup>3</sup>, Mudrikah, A<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1234</sup> Postgraduate Faculty, Universitas Islam Nusantara Bandung, Indonesia

A R T I C L E I N F O Article history: Received xx month 2021 Received in revised Form xx month 2021 Accepted xx month 2021 Available online xx month 2021

Keywords: Effectiveness, Supervision and Teacher Performance

#### A B S T R A C T

Scrutinizing the education quality should include teachers as a forefront in the education world. Even a good curriculum and programs will be meaningless if teachers do not implement them responsibly and consistently. This study aims to determine; (1). How is the teachers' performance supervision program in MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin; (2) How is the organizing program for teachers' performance supervision in MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin; (3). How are the movement and leadership of teachers' performance supervision in MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin; (4) How to control teacher performance supervision effectiveness in MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin. (5) How are the creative and innovative ideas in actualizing teachers' performance supervision effectiveness in MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin. Meanwhile, the results of this study were; (1) the

planning program had not been implemented effectively due to problems of limited resources; (2) organizing supervision had not been carried out optimally; (3) the movement and leadership had run relatively well; however, improvements are still required in the managerial aspects of leadership; (4) controlling the effectiveness of teachers' performance supervision was gradually conducted; (5) creative and innovative ideas emphasized the strengthening of teachers' performance supervision Madrasah Aliyah education units and *e-Kinerja* application. In addition, implementation and evaluation of teachers' performance supervision in MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin had been implemented in accordance with the Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) issued by the Ministry of Religion of the Republic of Indonesia. Nevertheless, the results were still ineffective due to problems of various resource limitations.

# 1. Introduction

The demand to improve the education quality implies schools' need to have educational human resources, both educators and other human resources, to perform optimally (Rahabav, 2016).

It clearly results in the need to develop Human Resources in accordance with formal legal demands such as qualifications and competencies, as well as the demands of an increasingly competitive external environment in today's era of globalizationv(Alwis et al., 2020). This era demands high-quality human resources with creative attitudes and innovative performance, which are ready and able to face intense competition (Panigrahi, 2012).

Human resources development for educators/teachers significantly encourages teachers to improve their performance (Zaqiah et al., 2018). This increase has implications for quantity and quality regarding how their performance is carried out (Ballou & Springer, 2015). Moreover, in the context of current changes, innovative performance is an increasingly urgent demand for teachers to carry out their roles and duties as educators. Hence, they can produce creative and innovative graduates that can thrive in today's global era (Marmin et al., 2020).

Therefore, an effort to continue teachers' performance development is vital to improve the education quality. Thus, it requires appropriate performance management in the context of the school organization (Zaqiah et al., 2018). At the micro-technical level, teachers as an educator are educational leaders. They have a substantial impact on the classroom's learning process, and this leadership role will

\*Corresponding author.

E-mail addresses: tambrin.muhammad69@gmail.com, iim\_wasliman@yahoo.com (Wasliman), hanafiah@fkip-uninus.ac.id (Hanafiah), achmadmudrikah@yahoo.co.id (Mudrikah)

be reflected in how teachers carry out their roles and duties (Sudarjat et al., 2015). It implies that teachers' performance is a considerably determining factor for the learning/education quality, which will impact the education output quality after completing school.

Teachers' performance is essentially a performance or work done by teachers in carrying out their duties as educators. The teachers' performance quality will significantly determine the quality of the educational outcomes. In fact, teachers have the most direct contact with students in the education/learning process at madrasah educational institutions (Marmin et al., 2020).

Therefore, devotion towards the teachers' performance development to keep improving becomes an urgent matter, especially concerning the increasing demands of the community related to the education quality (Hoque et al., 2020). Furthermore, this, of course, will have implications on the teachers' performance quality. In carrying out their roles and duties in schools, especially in the learning process, teachers require development and variations towards a more innovative direction. Innovative teachers' performance is crucial for the successful implementation of educational innovations to improve the education/learning quality (Manab, 2013).

There are various problems to improve the education quality related to the teachers' condition in Indonesia. Research conducted by Iskandar (2010) indicated that: 1) there were a diverse teachers' abilities in the learning process and knowledge mastery, 2) there was no accurate measurement to determine teachers' ability, 3) the guidance carried out did not reflect the needs, and 4) inadequate teachers welfare. If those issues are not resolved immediately, they will impact the low quality of education.

The low quality of education is determined by several significant problems, among others, according to Priansa (2014), due to factors of effectiveness, efficiency, relevance, and standardization of education, inadequate educational facilities, and infrastructure, unequal educational opportunities, high cost of education, low student achievement, and the low quality of teachers. Furthermore, according to Danim (2006), "one of the characteristics of the education crisis in Indonesia is that teachers have not been able to show adequate performance." It indicates that teachers' performance has not been fully supported by an adequate degree of competency mastery. Therefore, a comprehensive effort to improve teacher competence is highly required (Zaqiah et al., 2018). In addition, according to research conducted by Sanusi (2007), teachers do not yet possess "expertise in the subject's content, pedagogical, didactic and methodical, personal and social skills, especially disciplined and motivated, teamwork among teachers, and other educational personnel".

The Government, in this case, the Ministry of National Education (Kemendiknas) and the Ministry of Religious Affairs (Kemenag), have actually made various efforts to solve the above problems, such as training to improve teachers' competence and research. Notwithstanding, in reality, there are still several fundamental problems that need to be resolved immediately, for example, the low quality of teachers in various types, ways, and levels of education, both in educational institutions managed by the Ministry of National Education and in educational institutions managed by the Ministry of Religious Affairs (Majid, 2016)

Apart from teachers' professional ability, commitment, discipline, and motivation, it is essential to concern teachers' performance (Suriansyah & Effendi, 2019). Teachers' performance is assumed to be good if the teacher has carried out elements consisting of high loyalty and commitment to teaching tasks, mastering and developing learning materials, discipline in teaching and other tasks, creativity in teaching implementation, collaboration with all school members, the leadership of becoming a student role model, a good personality, honesty, and being objective in guiding students, as well as responsibility for their duties. Thus, discussing teacher performance quality cannot be separated from the achievement of learning outcomes (Fitria, 2020). This is because teacher performance determines its success.

Hence, the success of achieving educational goals is not solely dependent on providing teaching programs. The program needs to be supported by motivation, management systems, education administration, and supervision (Hasibuan & Yusuf, 2020). In this matter, the educational process's implementation can achieve optimal results if the Principal focuses more on the teacher. In this case, a teacher is the implementer of the educational program operationalization. Nevertheless, in practice, the teacher may develop innovations in carrying out their duties. In other words, innovative performance is essential (Nadhirin, 2018).

Education supervisors must fully understand the problems faced by teachers in their working areas (Sudarjat et al., 2015). In general, there are seven indicators that indicate teachers' weak performance in carrying out teaching assignments, namely: 1. Poor understanding of learning strategies, 2. Lack of proficiency in class management, 3. Low ability to conduct and utilize classroom action research, 4. Low achievement motivation, 5. Lack of discipline, 6. Low professional commitment, and 7. Low time management skills (Mulyasa, 2009).

Teachers have a crucial role in improving the education quality in an educational institution. Teachers are an essential component in educational attainment. The roles and duties carried out by teachers are very substantial. The teacher's job is not only to teach but also to educate, guide, nurture, and lead the class (Marmin et al., 2020). While the roles of teachers are also abundant, including: (1) as an instructor of learning, (2) as a manager of learning, (3) as an implementer of learning, (4) as an evaluator, (5) as a counselor, (6) as a curriculum implementers.

Other factors that cause low teacher professionalism, according (Mulyasa, 2009), are described as follows: 1)There are still many teachers who do not fully pursue their profession. This is because some teachers work outside their working hours to fulfill their daily needs, so they do not have the opportunity to improve themselves, whether they are reading, writing, or even browsing the internet, 2). The absence of a standard for teacher professionalism as demanded in developed countries, 3). The possibility of private universities producing outrageous or semi-finished teachers without considering their output in the field results in many teachers who do not comply with their professional ethics, 4). Teachers lack the motivation to improve self-quality because teachers are unrequired to do research, unlike lecturers in universities (Zaqiah et al., 2018).

Owe to that matter, research conducted by (Majid, 2016) stated that education is one of the primary keys in the development of quality human resources. To improve the education quality, it is significantly influenced by teachers' performance in the learning process. The teachers' performance will have implications for improving the learning quality. Teachers' performance is influenced by several factors, including competence, motivation, and commitment for the teacher as the prominent role. In addition, this study also obtained that: (1) competence had a positive and significant effect on teachers' performance, (2) motivation had a positive and significant effect on teachers' performance, (3) teachers' commitment has a positive and significant effect on teachers' performance, (4) teachers' competence, motivation, and commitment simultaneously had a positive and significant effect on teachers' performance and (5) teachers' performance had a positive and significant effect on the learning quality.

Based on the background of the problems of teachers' performance at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri (State Islamic Senior High School), this study aims to investigate;

- 1. How is the teachers' performance supervision program in MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin?.
- 2. How is the organizing program for teachers' performance supervision in MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin?.
- 3. How is the movement and leadership of teachers' performance supervision in MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin?.
- 4. How to control the effectiveness of teachers' performance supervision in MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin?.
- 5. How are the creative and innovative ideas in actualizing the effectiveness of teachers' performance supervision in MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin?.

The research object was Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 2 Banjarmasin and Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 3 Banjarmasin. These schools were selected as research objects since teachers' performance supervision of Madrasah Aliyah had not been implemented effectively. Owe to that matter, the researchers intended to examine further the reasons hindering the implementation of teacher's performance supervision. Moreover, it aims to find a solution to these problems.

#### 2. Research Methods

The research method in this dissertation employed the case study method. According to Bogdan and Bikien (1982): a case study is a detailed examination of one setting or one subject or one document storage or one particular event.

# Data Collection Technique

The data collection process refers to research that is often carried out on qualitative research methods. The description is as follows;

a. Interview

The descriptive method can be interpreted as a problem-solving system investigated by describing the current state of the subject/object of research (a person, institution, society, etc.) at present. In-depth interviews were conducted on research subjects whose unit of analysis was the implementation and evaluation of teachers' performance supervision at Madrasah Aliyah MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin.

b. Observation

This technique was employed to strengthen data that had been extracted from other techniques by observing the learning activities, the school's capacity, and infrastructure of MAN 2 and MAN 3 Banjarmasin directly.

#### c. Documentation

In the form of secondary data, researchers analyzed it in the form of secondary data. Further, the researchers analyzed documents in the form of SKP (Employee Performance Review), LAKIP (Government Institution's Performance Accountability Report), PKG (Teacher Performance Assessment), journals, supervision policy documents, quality/quality manuals, reports, madrasah performance achievements as well as documents and literature relevant to the research problem.

#### **Research Subjects**

Research subjects or research respondents were selected purposively. The informants selected were people who had sufficient knowledge and experience related to the research problem.

- 1. Head of Education Affairs, Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs, South Kalimantan Province
- 2. Head of the Teacher Affairs in the Education Affairs, Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious, South Kalimantan Province.
- 3. Principal of Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 2 and Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 3 Banjarmasin.
- 4. Assistant Principal of Curriculum Affairs at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 2 and Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 3 Banjarmasin.
- 5. Teachers of Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 2 and Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 3 Banjarmasin.

#### **Research Location**

The research location was carried out at the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of South Kalimantan Province, Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 2 and Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 3 Banjarmasin.

# **Data Collection Procedures**

The data collection procedure is the most critical step in research because the primary purpose is to obtain data. Procedures commonly used in qualitative research and employed in this research were as follows;

- 1. Observation: This technique was employed to strengthen data that had been extracted from other techniques. It was conducted by observing the learning activities directly, the schools' capacity, and the infrastructure of MAN 2 and Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 3 Banjarmasin.
- 2. Interview: In-depth interviews were conducted on the research subjects as the analysis unit. The instrument employed in this in-depth interview was an interview guide. The question items in the interview guide were not rigid but very flexible and dynamic. Moreover, it was designed to track and explore and analyze the Implementation of Teachers' Performance Supervision at Madrasah Aliyah by the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of South Kalimantan Province.
- 3. Documentation: In the form of secondary data, the researcher analyzed documents in the form of SKP, LAKIP, PKG, journals, supervision policy documents, quality/quality manuals, reports, madrasah performance achievements, and documents and literature relevant to the research problem to be discussed.

# Data Analysis Technique

The data analysis technique employed in this research was qualitative data analysis. It aimed to analyze the data collected, where the data was in the form of words, not numbers. The data analysis used various data that might have a relationship, then further analysis and thorough analysis were provided. The data analysis process was described as follows

- 1. Data Collection; The data obtained from interviews, observations, and documentation were recorded in field notes, consisting of two parts: descriptive and reflective. Descriptive notes recorded what the researchers saw, heard, witnessed, and experienced without the researcher's opinion and interpretation of the phenomenon is experienced. Meanwhile, reflective notes containing the researchers' impressions, comments, opinions, and interpretations of the findings obtained and constituted material for the data collection plan for the next stage.
- 2. Data Reduction: Reducing data means summarizing, selecting the main things, focusing on the critical things, and looking for themes and patterns. Thus, the data that had been reduced would provide a clearer picture and make it easier for researchers to carry out further data collection. Technically, the data reduction activities carried out in this study include: recapping the results of interviews then observing the results of collecting documents related to the focus of the study.
- 3. Data Display: The data display was directed so that the data resulting from reduction were organized and arranged in a relationship pattern. Hence, it is expected to understand it more efficiently and plan for further research work. In this step, the researchers attempted to compile relevant data to be information that can be concluded and had a specific meaning.

4. Conclusion and Verification: It is the stage of drawing conclusions based on findings and data verification. The initial conclusions were still provisional and would change if strong evidence was obtained to support the next data collection stage.

# Validation Testing Level

According to Lincoln (1984) in Sukardi (2011: 158), qualitative research must meet the data validity. Research is deemed to meet data validity if it: (1) Demonstrates correct value, (2) Provides a basis to be implemented, (3) Allows external decisions about the system consistency and the neutrality of findings and decisions ( Moleong, 2007). The data validity can be seen from four criteria: credibility, transferability, dependability, and confirmability. Testing the data validity would be carried out with a credibility test using the following techniques:

- 1. Extension of Observation : This study was extended three times if the data obtained was deemed inadequate and not credible. It was inadequate because not all problem formulations and problem focus had been materialized through the data. Additionally, it was not credible because the data source was still hesitant in providing data. Hence, the data obtained did not change.
- 2. Increasing Persistence : Increasing persistence means conducting observations more carefully and continuously. In this way, data certainty and the sequence of events could be recorded systematically. The researchers could also provide accurate and systematic data descriptions about the observation.
- 3. Triangulation : Deni Andriana explained that the researchers employed triangulation as a technique to check the data validity. In the sense, triangulation was a technique of checking the data validity that utilizes something else to compare the results of interviews with the object of research (Moloeng, 2004: 330).

Triangulation could be performed using various techniques (Nasution, 2003: 115), namely interviews, observations, and documents. Besides checking the correctness of the data, triangulation was also carried out to enrich the data. According to Nasution, triangulation was useful for investigating the validity of the researchers' interpretation of the data because triangulation is reflective.

#### 3. Results and Discussion

#### Implementation and Evaluation of Teachers' Performance Supervision at MAN 2 Banjarmasin

#### A. Teachers' Performance Supervision Program of MAN 2 Banjarmasin

1. Planning of Teachers' Performance Supervision Planning of MAN 2 Banjarmasin

The results of interviews and observations obtained a description of the supervision planning program in MAN 2 Banjarmasin, starting from an understanding of the performance supervision urgency. It was carried out in collaboration between teachers, so they understood that their performance was their responsibility as accountability to Allah SWT. When a sense of responsibility arises from oneself, then supervision will grow better.

This study also obtained that supervision was planned at the beginning of the school year and was running well. To support teacher performance supervision planning, it is necessary to realize that teacher's responsibility is worship. In human resource development, MAN 2 Banjarmasin continued to improve the quality of teaching and education personnel through various training, workshops, and seminars. The teaching and educational resources at MAN 2 Banjarmasin currently had 119 educators and education personnel with details of 54 civil servants and 55 non-civil servants. Meanwhile, the education level ratio was 40% of S-2 (Master degree) graduates and 45% of S-1 (undergraduate) graduates, and 15% of high school graduates. Additionally, 49 educators and education staff had obtained Educator Certificates from the Ministry of Education and Ministry of Religious Affairs.

2. The Purpose of Planning for Teachers' Performance Supervision of MAN 2 Banjarmasin

The findings of this study were related to the planning of teacher performance supervision of MAN 2 Banjarmasin: the achievement of the vision, mission, and achievement of the teaching and learning program. Teachers could plan teaching and learning programs according to the calendar and syllabus. Teachers could also implement teaching and learning activities according to the plans that have been made. Moreover, teachers could improve the quality of teaching and learning activities. In addition, the purpose of planning the teachers' performance supervision in MAN 2 Banjarmasin was to obtain information and documentation.

#### 3. Material for Teachers' Performance Supervision of MAN 2 Banjarmasin

The material to be concerned for teachers' performance supervision of MAN 2 Banjarmasin was teachers' capability to achieve the madrasah's vision and mission. Teachers were able to contribute optimally to improve the quality of student learning. In addition, teachers could enrich and improve the quality of their performance every year. Furthermore, the material for supervision includes planning for teaching and learning activities, implementing teaching and learning activities,

additional tasks that are the teacher's responsibility, and teacher competence (pedagogy, personality, social, professionalism).

This study also identified the material compiled in the teachers' performance planning of MAN2 Banjarmasin, as follows:

- Determining teachers' contribution to achieve educational goals in Madrasah by doing the job well.
- Determining cooperation between madrasah teachers and Principal to work together to maintain, improve, or develop teacher's performance.
- Establishing indicators of work performance that will be measured by the Principal of the madrasah.
- Analyzing and identifying various performance barriers and seeking solutions and efforts to overcome them
- 4. Indicators of Success for Teachers' Performance Supervision of MAN 2 Banjarmasin

Based on the results of document studies and interviews, indicators of the success of teacher performance supervision planning can be seen through the SKP (employee performance review). The SKP value was partially obtained from the PK Guru (Teachers' Performance Assessment) and based on the document available in the madrasah. In addition, the success of teachers' performance was also measured by the learning process/guidance for students, self-development as an educator, scientific publication/innovative work as a teacher, and other supporting elements. This study also indicated that teachers' performance in MAN 2 Banjarmasin was a success indicator of teachers' performance. It can be seen through their disciplines, such as coming to the classroom on time, and their material mastery, student's ability to absorb the material, and teachers' academic achievement. These are all success indicators of teachers' performance in MAN 2 Banjarmasin.

#### B. Program for Organizing Teacher Performance Supervision in MAN 2 Banjarmasin

1. Organization Design of Teachers' Performance Supervision

At the beginning of the school year, the Madrasah formed a team to carry out supervision, called PKG, occupied by the Assistance Principal of the Curriculum Affairs or senior teachers. Senior teachers supervised teachers who are in the same position or under their position. One supervisor teacher would supervise 5 or 6 peer teachers. Teachers' performance supervision was established according to a decree issued by the Principal of the Madrasah. This team consisted of the Principal of Madrasah, Assistant Principal of Curriculum Affairs, and senior teachers or teachers with the rank of class IV/a. This team's main task was to assess teachers, as outlined in the PKG document, with an assessment period of 6 months or twice a year, namely the January-June and July-December periods.

2. Job Distribution and Job Design for Teachers' Performance Supervision

Based on the interview results, it was obtained that the supervision process was carried out for one year, and the formative PKG was carried out at the beginning of the fiscal/academic year and only for the first year for new teachers or teacher transfers. Furthermore, summative PKG was held eight weeks before the end of the fiscal year. It was recommended that the PKG report be completed in mid-December because it would be used as an assessment material for the Employee Performance Review Achievement (CSKP). Teacher Performance Assessment with one semester assessment period was intended for teachers who lack a few credit points for promotion. Thus, these teachers are obliged to do additional assignments for one semester (namely, school principal, deputy, head of the librarian, head of the laboratory/workshop, head of the expertise program).

3. Integration and Coordination of Teachers' Performance Supervision

In coordinating and communicating teachers' performance supervision, MAN 2 Banjarmasin collaborated with the Educational Sector of Madrasah, teachers, and the Principal of Madrasah, the head of Madrasah education sector, and the head of teachers. It aimed to disseminate information on integrating and coordinating teachers' performance supervision to the authorized parties. Hence, it could be used as a reference in making policy for teachers' performance improvement. Furthermore, the research also found out the implementation of organizing the resources capability supervision. As a matter of fact, MAN 2 Banjarmasin had qualified teachers based on the requirements, or even higher than that. This condition indicated that MAN 2 teachers had adequate capabilities in performing their tasks.

4. The Development Organization Ability and Human Resources Capability

From the interview with the participants, it was obtained that the efforts to improve Human Resources of MAN 2 Banjarmasin to support teachers' performance supervision are as follows:

- Education, training, workshop, and seminar
- Position Promotion
- Staff Education

In addition, the interview results also indicated some efforts to improve teachers' performance, namely: 1) welcoming teacher properly; 2) giving new teaching assignments based on the teachers' expertise and skill; 3) forming a teacher working group in the field of study and Teachers

Professional Development Forum (MGMP) as a place to discuss planning and problems solving in class; 4) carrying out administrative and teachers' academic supervision as a reference for improvement and determining policies; 5) providing guidance for teachers' administrative, academic, and career; 6) providing opportunities for teachers to take part in a training held at schools, districts, provinces, and at the national level; 7) giving rewards to excellent teachers and giving punishment to lazy and troublesome teachers; 8) giving additional assignments to teachers, and 9) forming kinship among teachers and having a regular gathering in teachers' house.

5. Culture of Monitoring Organization toward Teachers' Performance Supervision

The culture of monitoring organization toward teachers' performance in MAN 2 Banjarmasin was exemplification and discipline. Based on the interview result with the participants, the organizational culture implemented in MAN 2 Banjarmasin could significantly improve teachers' performance supervision. In addition, organization performance culture was also conducted by following headmaster and teachers' exemplification. Discipline teachers usually had good performance because they had good time management and performance management. This research also discovered an organizational culture applied in MAN 2 Banjarmasin. Madrasah organization culture was established and upheld together with the founder of the educational institution, the Principal of madrasah, teachers, and entire elements in madrasah. Madrasah, as an Islamic Education institution concerning Islamic-based education development, strengthens its organization in a positive culture. Hence, it is expected that the learning will run effectively to generate high-quality output.

6. Movement and Leadership Allocating Resources, Adjusting Implementation Procedures with Resources Used in Teachers' Performance Supervision

The movement allocating resources and procedures in teachers' performance supervision in MAN 2 Banjarmasin was conducted by regular performance evaluation. Performance evaluation was usually carried out in the monthly meeting. Thus, performance achievement could be revealed early. Moreover, the teaching and learning activity's supervision was also regularly conducted through academic supervision, either conducted by the Principal or supervisor of the madrasah. The procedure set out was applied based on resources of teachers' performance monitoring of MAN 2 Banjarmasin.

#### C. Movement and Leadership of Teachers' Performance Supervision of MAN 2 Banjarmasin

1. Leadership Function of Teachers' Performance Supervision

In the implementation of teachers' performance supervision in MAN 2 Banjarmasin, the leadership function was carried out by full coordination. The Principal of the madrasah classified, delivered, provided information, provided input, and provided instructions to teachers. The results of the study indicated that the implementation of performance supervision of MAN 2 Banjarmasin ran well. If the leader were time-disciplined, the subordinates would follow it, and vice versa. If the leader could not give an excellent example to his subordinates, discipline could not be achieved. The effectiveness of leadership in improving the subordinates' performance should be supported by the ability to provide awareness to subordinates that the duties and responsibilities of their work are not only supervised by their supervisors but also under Allah SWT.

2. The Leadership Role in Movement towards the Implementation of Teachers' Performance Supervision in MAN 2 Banjarmasin

The Principal of the madrasah played a crucial role in teachers' performance supervision. The Principal was the one who had the strategy in improving teachers' performance. In addition, the attitude and behavior of the Principal of the madrasah significantly determined the leadership effectiveness. The role of the Principal of the madrasah was considerably influential in teachers' performance supervision. It proves from the teachers' discipline, learning target achievement, and madrasah vision and mission achievement.

- 3. Policies in Managing the Effectiveness of Teachers' Performance Supervision of MAN 2 Banjarmasin Based on the interview and document study, basic policies as the guideline in implementing teachers' performance supervision of MAN 2 Banjarmasin were as follows:
  - Constitution Number 20 of 2003 concerning the National Education System.
  - Constitution of Republic of Indonesia Number 14 of 2005 concerning Teachers and Lecturers.
  - Government Regulation Number 19 of 2005 concerning National Education Standards. Government Regulation Number 74 of 2008 concerning Teachers.
  - Regulation of the Minister of National Education Number 16 of 2007 concerning Academic Qualification Standards and Teacher Competencies.
  - Regulation of the Minister of National Education Number 18 of 2007 concerning Teacher Certification in Position.
  - Government Regulation of Republic of Indonesia No. 19 of 2017 concerning Teachers.
  - Government Regulation of Republic of Indonesia No. 74 of 2008 concerning Teachers.
  - Decree of the Ministry of National Education No. 35 of 2010 concerning Technical Guidelines for the Implementation of Teacher Functional Positions and Credit Figures.

4. Problems in the Implementation of Teachers' Performance Supervision of MAN 2 Banjarmasin Based on the interview conducted with the informant, the problems faced in the implementation of teachers' performance supervision were teachers did not have the same skill in finishing a task. Meanwhile, teachers must be scored as good regardless of the real condition. If teachers are not scored as good, it will affect their allowance.

# D. Controlling of the Effectiveness of Teachers' Performance Supervision of MAN 2 Banjarmasin

1. Controlling of the Effectiveness of Teachers' Performance Supervision This study found out that controlling the effectiveness of teachers' performance was carried out in

stages. The Principal created a performance monitoring program with a variety of instruments. Then, the instrument was carried out individually by each teacher under the Principal's supervision and assisted by the head of curriculum affairs and peers. If there were things that deviate or not on the right track, individual coaching could be carried out. It could be oral coaching or written coaching. The Principal of the madrasah and the vice principal supervised teachers' performance by peeking. It was usually done in the morning before the pandemic. Administrative supervision at MAN 2 Banjarmasin was highly concerned. Especially at the beginning of the semester, teachers were encouraged to complete the administration. Then during the pandemic, they conducted students' polling regarding teachers' performance.

2. The Role of the Principal of Madrasah in Controlling the Effectiveness of Teacher Performance Supervision

The Principal of the madrasah's role in controlling the effectiveness of teachers' performance supervision was carrying out duties according to his function. He then reported it through the vice principal of academic affairs. Performance supervision was also carried out through a set of administrative tools, but what really needed to be emphasized was the awareness of individuals, groups, and all employees of their respective responsibilities and duties that must always be put forward.

- E. Creative and Innovative Ideas in Actualizing the Effectiveness of Teachers' Performance Supervision in MAN 2 Banjarmasin
  - 1. Creative and Innovative Ideas in Actualizing the Effectiveness of Teachers' Performance Supervision in MAN 2 Banjarmasin

Based on the research result, the following ways were to actualize the effectiveness of teachers' performance of MAN 2 Banjarmasin:

- Advising that the tasks and responsibilities of teachers would be accounted for Allah SWT.
- The Principal and the Vice-Principal of Madrasah were role models for the subordinates.
- Giving awards for those who worked excellently and giving reprimand or even punishment for those who broke the rule.
- Authorizing work units of the teachers' team in MAN 2 Banjarmasin to optimize the function and role in improving the performance supervision.
- 2. Creative and Innovative Steps in Improving the Effectiveness of Teachers' Performance Effectiveness of MAN 2 Banjarmasin

The most crucial thing to improve the effectiveness of teachers' performance supervision was by approaching teachers when they were in trouble. In addition, a religious approach was required to touch teachers' hearts. Presently, teachers' attendance checking is online. Meanwhile, before this pandemic, teachers filled their attendance by fingerprint when they come to school. The most important thing was teachers performing their primary task and function and being responsible for their task and profession.

# Implementation and Evaluation of Teachers' Performance Supervision of MAN 3 Banjarmasin

- A. Program of Teachers' Performance Supervision in MAN 3 Banjarmasin
- 1. Planning of Teachers' Performance Supervision in MAN 3 Banjarmasin

Based on the results of interviews, observations, and document studies, it was discovered that the planning of teachers' performance supervision in MAN 3 Banjarmasin refers to the Regulation of the Minister of State for Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform Number 16 of 2009. It states that Teacher Performance Assessment is an assessment carried out on each item of the teacher's main task for career development, rank, and position.

2. The Planning Objectives of Teachers' Performance Supervision in MAN 3 Banjarmasin

The purpose of monitoring supervision and performance reports was to measure teachers' competence regarding teaching skills and find out teachers' daily activities. Meanwhile, other information mentions that teachers' performance supervision aimed to generate teachers who were ready to teach, having honorable behavior, and being disciplined.

Furthermore, the research results identified the planning objectives of teachers' performance supervision, among others: 1) Underlying policies regarding teachers' promotion and career along

with the rewards that should be earned; 2) As an indicator to determine the level of competence; 3) Improving teacher and school performance including efficiency and effectiveness. 4) Providing guarantees always to carry out their duties and responsibilities and be positive in learning to support their students' achievement. 5) Providing a foundation for the implementation of a sustainable professional program (PKB), and 6) Being a basis for determining the effectiveness of teachers' performance.

3. Supervision Material of Teachers' Performance in MAN 3 Banjarmasin

According to the results of interviews, observation, and document study, it was identified that the supervision material was the learning process, learning design, syllabus, journals, teaching materials, semester programs, and annual programs. The supervision material regarding daily performance reported in the form of paper was attendance, scheduled teaching activities, conducting discussions/coordination with fellow teachers. Additionally, the achievement results that had been carried out, such as;

- Class supervision material including: during the learning process, lesson plans, syllabus, journals, semester programs, and annual programs.
- Supervisory material about daily performance reports filled out online by teachers containing teacher activities on that day.
- Supervision material consisting of the syllabus, lesson plans, learning materials, journals, teaching
  and learning activities, semester programs, and annual programs.
- Supervision material regarding daily performance reports in the form of attendance, scheduled teaching activities, conducting discussions/coordination with peer teachers, and the achievement results that have been carried out.
- Supervision material specifically concerns the teachers' competence, including pedagogical competence, personality, social and professional

# 4. Success Indicators of Teachers' Performance Supervision in MAN 3 Banjarmasin

According to participant information, a success indicator of supervision means being able to carry out learning activities properly to improve the education quality of the madrasah.

- Success indicator of performance report is the implementation of activities or assignments given to the teacher properly
- Success indicator means teachers consciously conduct learning activities every day
- Supervision success indicator refers to the ability to carry out the learning process properly following the planned learning objectives to improve the education quality in the madrasah
- The performance report's success indicator means the activities or assignments given to the teacher council are adequately accomplished.

#### B. Program for Organizing Teacher Performance Supervision in MAN 3 Banjarmasin

- 1. Organization Design of Teachers' Performance Supervision
  - In organizing this program, a supervision schedule was arranged from the daily performance through the *e-Kinerja* application. Then, the Principal, the vice-principal, and senior teachers conducted supervision.
- 2. Job Division and Design of Teachers' Performance Supervision

The job division was done based on the learning schedule and assignment task decided by the curriculum affairs, and it was approved by the Principal of the madrasah. The supervision design was the supervisors' team, consisting of the Principal of madrasah, the vice-principal of curriculum affairs, and senior teachers. It also appointed the administration staff to coordinate the collection and ask for the Principal's approval as well as evaluate teachers' performance. The supervision ratio conducted by the senior teachers to other teachers was 5 to 10 teachers supervised by one senior teacher. Further, the Principal of Madrasah would issue an assignment task for the supervisors.

3. Integration and Coordination of Performance Supervision

Integration and coordination of the supervision of madrasah principals toward teachers were conducted by forming a management team led by the head of the unit. Supervision was led by the head of the curriculum. Meanwhile, the performance reports were led by the head of administration staff. The results of this research found out that integration and coordination of teachers' performance were implemented by coordinating with the Principal of Madrasah through a coordination meeting with the Principal of Madrasah Education at the Ministry of Religion Office of Banjarmasin City. This coordination was to know the conditions and problems faced to conduct follow-up or problem-solving.

#### 4. Development of Organizational and Human Resource Capabilities

The development of organizational capacity was carried out excellently because competent employees led it. Besides, teachers could follow it easily. 80% of teachers could carry out the performance determined by the principal madrasah, and 20% of teachers still needed guidance to carry out the predetermined performance. In addition, the development of organizational capabilities

was carried out very well because it was led by competent employees to follow it. Most of them were able to perform well, and a few employees still needed guidance.

5. Organizational Culture of Teachers' Performance Supervision

Supervision culture refers to supervision carried out every year and daily performance reports in the form of papers that were collected every month. Further, supervision culture means regular supervision and a daily performance report of teachers submitted to the Principal of Madrasah once a month. Additionally, supervision culture was in the form of supervision and performance reports.

6. Movement and Leadership, Resources Allocation, Implementation Procedures Adjustment with Resources Used in Teachers' Performance Supervision

Movement and leadership were conducted through resource allocation, implementation procedures adjustment with resources used in teachers' performance supervision. Based on the study results, the leadership mobilization was carried out by coordinating with the Assistant Principal of Academics, Student Affairs, Public Relations, Infrastructure, Head of Administration Staffs, and Head of Committee related to performance improvement and appreciation for teachers performing their duties well. The appreciation was in the form of allowances in accordance with regulations.

#### C. Movement and Leadership of Teachers' Performance Supervision of MAN 3 Banjarmasin

1. Leadership Functions in Teachers' Performance Supervision of MAN 3 Banjarmasin

Based on the interview result, the Principal of the Madrasah functions to control and evaluate the teachers' performance results. The Principal recorded the supervision result and evaluated it with the teacher council. Besides, the teacher checked the performance reports and followed up on weaknesses and strengths. The Principal of Madrasah also functioned to control and evaluate the results of teacher performance and lead the implementation of teachers' performance supervision.

2. The Leadership Role in the Movement of Implementation of Teachers' Performance Supervision in MAN 3 Banjarmasin

The result of the research indicated that the Principal of Madrasah had a role as a policy maker related to education quality improvement and the allowance payment. It was expected to encourage teachers to be more disciplined in carrying out their duties properly. The Principal of Madrasah made a schedule of supervision. Furthermore, the Principal of Madrasah issued assignment letters, formed work teams, and provided performance incentives based on the regulations. The Principal of Madrasah authorized the supervisor team to carry out supervision through the issuance of an Assignment Decree consisting of Vice-Principal of Madrasah and senior teachers

3. Policy Support in Managing the Effectiveness of Teachers' Performance Supervision in MAN 3 Banjarmasin

In regulating the effectiveness of teachers' performance supervision, MAN 3 Banjarmasin collaborated with the Teachers Department of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Regional Office through the Madrasah Education Department to monitor the development of potential teachers and education personnel

# 4. Problems in the Implementation of Teachers' Performance Supervision in MAN 3 Banjarmasin

The interview results identified the problems in the implementation: teachers who were not fully responsible and had different views regarding the policies. In other words, different understanding and views among teachers were the problems in this implementation. Sometimes, a feeling of reluctance and subjectivity still mixed the supervision.

# D. Controlling Effectiveness of Teachers' Performance Supervision in MAN 3 Banjarmasin

1. Controlling of Teachers' Performance Supervision

Effectiveness control of teachers' performance supervision was carried out by scheduling the supervision and forming supervisor teams consisting of the Assistant Principal of curriculum affairs and senior teachers to supervise the teacher council. In addition, the administration team collected data and reminded teachers to collect daily performance reports on paper. From the results of interviews and document studies, the supervision team gave teachers their supervision schedules. Furthermore, for the performance reports, the administration team would remind and control the performance report collection. Supervision was carried out according to schedule. Meanwhile, the functions of the Teacher Affairs Department were to monitor teachers' development in Vocational Madrasah and Madrasah Aliyah. On the other hand, the teacher's assessment was carried out by the Principal of Madrasah as the direct supervisor. Thus, regular coordination with the Principal of Madrasah was required to control the implementation of teachers' performance supervision.

2. The Role of the Principal of Madrasah in Controlling the Effectiveness of Teachers' Performance Supervision

The Principal played a significant role in providing the policy, supervise, and evaluate teachers' performance. Additionally, the supervision function and teachers' performance assessment was

conducted by the Principal of the madrasah. Therefore, teachers conducted the coordination functions with the Principal as follows: 1) Direct or indirect coordination with the Principal of madrasah, and 2) Direct coordination was done through a meeting of the Principal's working teams. Indirect coordination was done through information from the Board of Religious Affairs of Regency/City. In addition, learning activities in MAN 3 Banjarmasin during this pandemic are conducted by online learning. The madrasah e-learning was issued by the Ministry of Religious Affairs. In fact, the features of madrasah e-learning are relatively good. The examples of these advanced features are timeline as a forum for discussion, student attendance, teacher attendance, and teaching material. The teaching material feature made it students easier to get material references.

The results of this study also found out teachers who were not disciplined when the Principal was away. These teachers did not carry out their duties optimally. However, the Principal still supervised teachers by asking trusted students or teachers to be an informant. Thus, the Principal would know whether there were teachers skipping the class or coming late.

- E. Creative and Innovative Ideas in Actualizing Effectiveness of Teachers' Performance Supervision of Madrasah Aliyah 3 Banjarmasin
  - 1. Creative and Innovative Ideas in Actualizing Effectiveness of Teachers' Performance Supervision of Madrasah Aliyah 3 Banjarmasin

The creative and innovative ideas to actualize the performance effectiveness were by using electronic absence checking (fingerprint), website application on the performance report (*e-Kinerja*), and website application related to e-learning.

2. Creative and Innovative Steps in Actualizing Effectiveness of Teachers' Performance Supervision of Madrasah Aliyah 3 Banjarmasin

The steps taken to have effective supervision required teachers to do electronic attendance checking to have more accurate time. In addition, teachers used the *e-Kinerja* application to compile daily activities and printed them out to be submitted to the administration staff. Besides, teachers used e-learning applications to teach during the current pandemic.

Furthermore, the results of interviews, observations, and document studies indicated that this Covid-19 pandemic did not reduce control over teachers' performance in carrying out their duties despite the online teaching activities. Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 3 Banjarmasin applied an emergency curriculum, where teachers took turns to go to school to keep providing educational services. Teachers' attendance list was conducted online. Even, there was a learning evaluation every month to assess the teaching and learning process.

#### 4. CONCLUSION

From the research conducted, the researchers concluded that the implementation and evaluation of teachers' performance supervision of MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin was relatively suitable with the Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) issued by the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia. Nevertheless, the result was not practical due to some problems arising. Furthermore, the conclusions of the implementation and evaluation of teachers' performance supervision of MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin were as follows:

- Program of Teachers' Performance Supervision in MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin The program of teachers' performance supervision in MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin was gradually carried out. It started from the level of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia to the level of academic units. It brings several impacts on teachers to adjust their performance based on the provisions stipulated. Teachers' performance supervision in MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin would run well if appropriately arranged by the teacher and the Principal of Madrasah.
- 2. Organizing Program of Teachers' Performance Supervision of MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin

Teachers' performance supervision of MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin had been applied in the form of the Supervisor Team (PK). It functioned to supervise teachers' performance. It could positively impact teachers' performance improvement if it were conducted seriously based on the stipulation and regulation. Hence, performance evaluation carried out by supervisors of MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin had run effectively.

3. Movement and Leadership of Teachers' Performance Supervision in MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin

The movement and leadership of teachers' performance supervision could directly impact efforts to improve teachers' performance with the strategic role of leadership in MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin. The strategic role of leadership in Madrasah Aliyah included managerial

abilities in mobilizing teacher resources. As a matter of fact, effective leadership and efforts to mobilize teaching staff resources would impact teachers' performance in MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin.

4. Controlling of Teachers' Performance Supervision Effectiveness in MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin

In the scope of education management, controlling was a strategic step to ensure whether the supervision process was conducted under the planned objectives and the effectiveness of teachers' performance supervision. Therefore, control had a crucial role in the learning process, especially in MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin.

5. Creative and innovative ideas in actualizing the effectiveness of teachers' performance supervision in MAN 2 Banjarmasin and MAN 3 Banjarmasin

Creative and innovative ideas emphasized the importance of Supervisor Teams in Madrasah Aliyah education units and *e-Kinerja* implementation.

#### 5. References

- Alwis, A., Z., S. M., Effendi, M., & Jama, J. (2020). Developing Academic Supervision Model To Improve Islamic Education (PAI) Teachers' Performance At Madrasah Aliyah (Islamic Senior High Schools). *Digital Press Social Sciences and Humanities*, 6, 00014. https://doi.org/10.29037/digitalpress.46379
- Ballou, D., & Springer, M. G. (2015). Using Student Test Scores to Measure Teacher Performance. *Educational Researcher*, 44(2), 77–86. https://doi.org/10.3102/0013189X15574904
- Fitria, H. (2020). The Implementation of Class Supervision and Its Positive Impact. *Journal of Social Work and Science Education*, 1(2), 146–160.
- Hasibuan, L., & Yusuf, M. (2020). Education Personnel Management Model for Improving the Performance of Public Madrasah Aliyah Teachers in Jambi Province. *International Journal of Progressive Sciences and Technologies (IJPSAT)*, 2019, 393–401.
- Hoque, K. E., Bt Kenayathulla, H. B., D/O Subramaniam, M. V., & Islam, R. (2020). Relationships Between Supervision and Teachers' Performance and Attitude in Secondary Schools in Malaysia. SAGE Open, 10(2), 215824402092550. https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244020925501
- Majid, A. (2016). Strategi Pembelajaran. PT Remaja. Rosdakarya.
- Manab, A. (2013). The Implementation of Curriculum Diversification of Madrasah Aliyah Darul Hikmah , Tulungagung , Indonesia. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 4(18), 64–70.
- Marmin, M., Koderi, K., Muin, J. A., Fahri, J., & Imam, S. (2020). The Effectiveness of Supervision Program At Madrasah Aliyah in Pesawaran Regency. *Educational Management*, 9(2), 248–257.
- Mulyasa, E. (2009). Menjadi Guru Profesional. PT Remaja. Rosdakarya.
- Nadhirin, N. (2018). Teaching Supervision of Madrasah Headmaster Based on Pesantren Culture. *QIJIS (Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies)*, 5(2). https://doi.org/10.21043/qijis.v5i2.3122
- Panigrahi, M. (2012). Review Article Implementation of Instructional Supervision in Secondary School: Approaches, Praspects and Problems. *Science, Technology and Arts Research Journa*, 1(3), 59–67.
- Rahabav, P. (2016). The Effectiveness of academic supervision for teachers. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 7(9), 47–55.
- Sudarjat, J., Abdullah, T., & Sunaryo, W. (2015). Supervision, Leadership, and Working Motivation to Teachers' Performance. *International Journal of Managerial Studies and Research (IJMSR)*, 3(6), 146– 152. www.arcjournals.org
- Suriansyah, A., & Effendi, R. (2019). Effect of Academic Supervision and School Culture on Teacher's Teaching Quality in Public Islamic Senior High School Banjarmasin. *Journal of K6, Education, and Management*, 2(2), 126–132. https://doi.org/10.11594/jk6em.02.02.07
- Zaqiah, Q. Y., Suhendar, D., & Maryani, N. (2018). Evaluation of Teacher Performance to Quality Learning in Madrasah Aliyah (A Comparative Study between Madrasah Aliyah Model and Non-Model Madrasah Aliyah in West Java). Proceedings of the International Conference on Islamic Education (ICIE 2018), 261(Icie), 178–183. https://doi.org/10.2991/icie-18.2018.32